Foundations for Programming Languages

John C. Mitchell
Department of Computer Science
Stanford University
jcm@cs.stanford.edu

This book will be published by MIT Press.
Please do not circulate.
© John C. Mitchell 1995.

July 24, 1995

Contents

1	Intr		L 6				
	1.1	Model Programming Languages	16				
	1.2		17				
	1.3	Equations, Reduction, and Semantics	20				
		1.3.1 Axiomatic semantics	20				
		1.3.2 Operational semantics	21				
		1.3.3 Denotational semantics	22				
	1.4	Types and Type Systems	22				
	1.5	Notation and Mathematical Conventions	25				
	1.6	Set-theoretic Background	26				
		1.6.1 Fundamentals	26				
		1.6.2 Relations and Functions	29				
	1.7	Syntax and Semantics	32				
		1.7.1 Object language and meta-language	32				
		1.7.2 Grammars	32				
		1.7.3 Lexical analysis and parsing	34				
		1.7.4 Example mathematical interpretation	35				
	1.8	Induction	37				
		1.8.1 Induction on the natural numbers	37				
		1.8.2 Induction on expressions and proofs	41				
		1.8.3 Well-founded induction	46				
2	The	The Language PCF 50					
	2.1	Introduction	50				
	2.2	Syntax of PCF	51				
		2.2.1 Overview	51				
		2.2.2 Booleans and natural numbers	52				
		2.2.3 Pairing and functions	55				
		2.2.4 Declarations and syntactic sugar	59				
		2.2.5 Recursion and fixed-point operators	62				
		2.2.6 PCF syntax summary and collected examples	66				
	2.3	PCF Programs and Their Semantics	69				
		2.3.1 Programs and results	69				
		2.3.2 Axiomatic semantics	70				
		2.3.3 Denotational semantics	73				
		2.3.4 Operational semantics	74				
		2.3.5 Equivalence relations defined by each form of semantics	76				

	2.4	PCF I	Reduction and Symbolic Interpreters
		2.4.1	Nondeterministic reduction
		2.4.2	Reduction strategies
		2.4.3	The left-most and lazy reduction strategies
		2.4.4	Parallel reduction
		2.4.5	Eager PCF
	2.5	PCF I	Programming Examples, Expressive Power and Limitations
		2.5.1	Records and n -tuples
		2.5.2	Searching the natural numbers
		2.5.3	Iteration and tail recursion
		2.5.4	Total recursive functions
		2.5.5	Partial recursive functions
		2.5.6	Non-definability of parallel operations
	2.6	Variat	ions and Extensions of PCF
		2.6.1	Summary of extensions
		2.6.2	Unit and sum types
		2.6.3	Recursive types
		2.6.4	Lifted types
0	T T •		Al
3			Algebra and Algebraic Data Types 133
	3.1		uction
	3.2		w of algebraic specification
	3.3	3.3.1	ras, Signatures and Terms
			Algebras
		3.3.2 3.3.3	Syntax of algebraic terms
		3.3.4	Algebras and the interpretation of terms
	3.4		ions, Soundness and Completeness
	J.4	3.4.1	Equations
		3.4.1 $3.4.2$	Term algebras and substitution
		3.4.2 $3.4.3$	Semantic implication and an equational proof system
		3.4.4	Forms of completeness
		3.4.5	Congruence, quotients and deductive completeness
		3.4.6	Nonempty sorts and the least model property
	3.5		morphisms and Initiality
	0.0	3.5.1	Homomorphisms and isomorphisms
		3.5.2	Initial algebras
	3.6		raic Data Types
	J.0	3.6.1	Specification and data abstraction
		3.6.2	Initial algebra semantics and datatype induction
		3.6.3	Examples and error values
		3.6.4	Alternative approaches to error values
	3.7		te Systems
		3.7.1	Basic definitions
		3.7.2	Confluence and provable equality
		3.7.3	Termination
		3.7.4	Critical pairs

		3.7.5	Left-linear non-overlapping rewrite systems
		3.7.6	Local confluence, termination and completion
		3.7.7	Applications to algebraic datatypes
4	Sim		rped Lambda Calculus 207
	4.1	Introd	uction
	4.2	Types	
		4.2.1	Syntax
		4.2.2	Interpretation of types
	4.3	Terms	
		4.3.1	Context-sensitive syntax
		4.3.2	Syntax of λ^{\rightarrow} terms
		4.3.3	Terms with product, sum and related types
		4.3.4	Formulas-as-types correspondence
		4.3.5	Typing algorithm
	4.4		Systems
		4.4.1	Equations and theories
		4.4.2	Reduction rules
		4.4.3	Reduction with additional rules
		4.4.4	Proof-theoretic methods for consistency and conservativity
	4.5	Henkir	n Models, Soundness and Completeness
		4.5.1	General models and the meanings of terms
		4.5.2	Applicative structures, extensionality and frames
		4.5.3	Environment model condition
		4.5.4	Type and equational soundness
		4.5.5	Completeness for Henkin models without empty types
		4.5.6	Completeness with empty types
		4.5.7	Combinators and the combinatory model condition
		4.5.8	Combinatory and lambda algebras
		4.5.9	Henkin models for other types
5	Mo	dels of	Typed Lambda Calculus 262
	5.1	Introd	uction
	5.2	Domai	n-Theoretic Models and Fixed Points
		5.2.1	Recursive definitions and fixed point operators
		5.2.2	Complete partial orders, lifting and cartesian products
		5.2.3	Continuous functions
		5.2.4	Fixed points and the full continuous hierarchy
		5.2.5	CPO model for PCF
	5.3	Fixed-	point Induction
	5.4		tational Adequacy and Full Abstraction
		5.4.1	Approximation theorem and computational adequacy
		5.4.2	Full abstraction for PCF with parallel operations
	5.5		sion-theoretic Models
	2.9	5.5.1	Introduction
		5.5.2	Modest sets
		5.5.3	Full recursive hierarchy
		-	,

	5.6	Partial	Equivalence Relations and Recursion
		5.6.1	Partial equivalence relation interpretation of types
		5.6.2	Generalization to partial combinatory algebras
			Lifting, partial functions and recursion
		5.6.4	Recursion and the intrinsic order
		5.6.5	Lifting, products and function spaces of effective cpos
6	_		programs 325
	6.1		action
	6.2	_	programs
			L-values and R-values
			Syntax of while programs
	6.3	_	ional Semantics
			Basic symbols in expressions
			Locations and stores
			Evaluation of expressions
			Execution of commands
	6.4		tional Semantics
			Typed lambda calculus with stores
			Semantic functions
			Equivalence of operational and denotational semantics
	6.5		after Assertions About While Programs
		6.5.1	First-order and partial correctness assertions
		6.5.2	Proof rules
		6.5.3	Soundness
		6.5.4	Relative completeness
	6.6	Semant	ics of Additional Program Constructs
		6.6.1	Overview
		6.6.2	Blocks with local variables
		6.6.3	Procedures
		6.6.4	Combining blocks and procedure declarations
7	Cot		and Recursive Types 371
1		egories Introdu	971
	$7.1 \\ 7.2$		an Closed Categories
	1.4		Category theory and typed languages
			Categories, functors and natural transformations
			Definition of cartesian closed category
			Soundness and the interpretation of terms
			Henkin models as ccc's
			Categorical characterization of meaning function
	7.3		Lambda Models and Functor Categories
	1.0		Overview
			Possible worlds
			Applicative structures
			Extensionality, combinators and functor categories
		7.3.5	Environments and meanings of terms

		7.3.6	Soundness and completeness
		7.3.7	Kripke lambda models as cartesian closed categories
	7.4	Doma	in models of recursive types
		7.4.1	A motivating example
		7.4.2	Diagrams, cones and limits
		7.4.3	F-algebras
		7.4.4	ω -Chains and initial F-algebras
		7.4.5	O-categories and embeddings
		7.4.6	Colimits and O-colimits
		7.4.7	Locally continuous functors
		7.4.8	Examples of the general method
8	Log	ical R	elations 442
	8.1	Introd	luction to Logical Relations
	8.2	Logica	al Relations Over Applicative Structures
		8.2.1	Definition of Logical Relation
		8.2.2	The Basic Lemma
		8.2.3	Partial functions and theories of models
		8.2.4	Logical partial equivalence relations
		8.2.5	Quotients and extensionality
	8.3		Theoretic Results
		8.3.1	Completeness for Henkin models
		8.3.2	Normalization
		8.3.3	Confluence and other reduction properties
		8.3.4	Reduction with fix and additional operations
	8.4		l Surjections and Specific Models
		8.4.1	Partial surjections and the full classical hierarchy
		8.4.2	Full recursive hierarchy
		8.4.3	Full continuous hierarchy
	8.5	-	sentation Independence
		8.5.1	Motivation
		8.5.2	Example language
		8.5.3	General representation independence
	8.6		alizations of logical relations
		8.6.1	Introduction
		8.6.2	Motivating examples: complete partial orders and Kripke models 484
		8.6.3	Sconing and relations
		8.6.4	Comparison with logical relations
		8.6.5	General case and applications to specific categories
9	-		hism and Modularity 499
	9.1		luction
		9.1.1	Overview
		9.1.2	Types as function arguments
		9.1.3	General products and sums
	6.5	9.1.4	Types as specifications
	9.2	Predic	cative Polymorphic Calculus

		9.2.1	Syntax of types and terms	8
		9.2.2	Comparison with other forms of polymorphism	3
		9.2.3	Equational proof system and reduction	
		9.2.4	Models of predicative polymorphism	
		9.2.5	ML-style polymorphic declarations	
	9.3	Impred	licative Polymorphism	
		9.3.1	Introduction	
		9.3.2	Expressiveness and properties of theories	
		9.3.3	Termination of reduction	
		9.3.4	Summary of semantic models	
		9.3.5	Models based on universal domains	
		9.3.6	Partial equivalence relation models	
	9.4	Data A	Abstraction and Existential Types	
	9.5		al Products, Sums and Program Modules	
		9.5.1	The ML Module Language	
		9.5.2	Predicative calculus with products and sums	
		9.5.3	Representing Modules With Products and Sums	
		9.5.4	Predicativity and the relationship between universes	
10			and related concepts 57	_
			uction	
	10.2	Simply	Typed Lambda Calculus with Subtyping	5
	10.3	Record	ls	1
		10.3.1	General properties of record subtyping	1
		10.3.2	Typed calculus with records and subtyping	2
	10.4	Seman	tic Models of Subtyping	6
		10.4.1	Overview	6
		10.4.2	Conversion interpretation of subtyping	6
		10.4.3	Subset interpretation of types	3
		10.4.4	Partial equivalence relations as types	8
	10.5	Recurs	ive Types and a Record Model of Objects	3
	10.6	Polym	orphism with Subtype Constraints	1
	æ	тс	an a	-
11		e Infe	rence uction to Type Inference	
			inference for λ^{\rightarrow} with Type Variables	
	11.4		The language λ_t^{\rightarrow}	
			Substitution, instances and unification	
			An algorithm for principal Curry typings	
			Implicit typing	
	11 0		Equivalence of typing and unification	
	11.3		inference with Polymorphic Declarations	
			ML type inference and polymorphic variables	
			Two sets of implicit typing rules	
			Type inference algorithms	
			Equivalence of ML_1 and ML_2	
		11.3.5	Complexity of ML type inference	3

Foundations for Programming Languages		
Bibliography	661	
Index	676	

List of Figures

1.1	Binary trees
3.1	A locally confluent but non-confluent reduction
3.2	Disjoint reductions
	Trivial overlap
	Critical pair
5.1	Ordering of continuous functions $\mathcal{B}_{\perp} \to \mathcal{B}_{\perp}$
7.1	Morphism of cones
7.2	F-algebras and unique morphisms of cocones
7.3	Unique morphism from $\nu^{(i)}$ into limit cone μ over Δ^{prj}
11.1	Unification on expression graphs

List of Tables

0.1	Introductory course outline	
0.2	Mathematical course on typed lambda calculus	
0.3	Course on type theory	Ć
1.1	Well-founded relations for common forms of induction	7
2.1	Equational proof system for PCF	L
2.2	Reduction axioms for PCF 75	í
2.3	Left-most reduction for PCF	í
2.4	Lazy reduction for PCF	7
2.5	Eager PCF reduction)
2.6	Evaluation contexts for lazy PCF reduction	3
3.1	Algebraic specification of stacks	2
3.2	Algebraic specification of multi-sets, <i>nat</i> and <i>bool</i>	3
3.3	Algebraic specification of trees	
3.4	A specification for set, nat and bool)
3.5	A specification for <i>list</i> , <i>atom</i> and <i>bool</i>	7
3.6	Naive treatment of error values for <i>list</i> , <i>atom</i> and <i>bool</i>	3
3.7	A specification for $list$, $atom$ and $bool$ with error values)
4.1	Type-checking algorithm	}
7.1	Smyth-Plotkin method for finding fixed-points of functors	3
11.1	Recursive algorithm <i>Unify</i>	3
11.2	Algorithm PT for principal λ_t^{\rightarrow} (Curry) typing 631	L
11.3	Algorithm reducing λ_t^{\rightarrow} (Curry) typing to unification	7
11.4	Algorithm <i>PTL</i> for principal typing with let	3

Preface

This book presents a framework for the analysis of syntactic, operational and semantic properties of programming languages. The framework is based on a mathematical system called typed lambda calculus. The main features of lambda calculus are a notation for functions and other computable values, together with an equational logic and rules for evaluating expressions. The book is organized around a sequence of lambda calculi with progressively more complicated type systems. These are used to analyze and discuss relevant programming language concepts. The emphasis is on sequential languages, although many of the techniques and concepts also apply to concurrent programming languages.

This logic without function variables may be used to axiomatize and analyze many of the data types commonly used in programming. The next system is a lambda calculus with function types and, optionally, cartesian products and disjoint unions. When enriched with recursive definitions, this language provides a useful framework for studying operational and semantic properties of functional programs. When combined with algebraic data types, this system is adequate to define many Algol-like languages. In particular, with types for memory locations and stores, we may study traditional axiomatic, operational and denotational semantics of imperative programs. More advanced technical machinery, such as the method of logical relations, category theory, and the semantics of recursively defined types are covered in the middle chapters. The last three chapters of the book study polymorphic types, along with declaration forms for abstract data types and program modules, systems of subtyping, and type inference.

Prerequisites and relation to other topics

The book is written for upper-level undergraduates or beginning graduate students specializing in theoretical computer science, software systems, or mathematics. It is also suitable for advanced study or technical reference. While the only true prerequisite is the proverbial "appropriate level of mathematical maturity," most students will find some prior experience with formal logic, computability or complexity theory, and programming languages helpful. In general, students familiar with these topics at the level of a general introductory course such as [AU92] or above should proceed with confidence and with their sleeves rolled up. To give the prospective reader or instructor more information, the primary connections with related topics are summarized below.

Mathematical logic. The systems of lambda calculus used in this book share many features with traditional mathematical logic. Each has a syntax, a proof system, and a model theory. For this reason, general ideas from logic such as the definition of well-formed formulas, soundness and completeness of proof systems, and interpretation of expressions in mathematical structures are used. These are introduced briefly as needed. First-order logic itself is used only in the sections on proving properties of programs; here an intuitive understanding of the meaning of formulas is assumed.

Computability and complexity theory. The basic distinction between computable and non-computable functions is used in the study of PCF (Chapter 2). The text defines and uses the class of partial recursive functions and refers to Turing machines in the exercises of two sections. A few additional concepts from recursion theory are assumed in constructing semantic models using Gödel numbering of recursive functions (Chapter 4). All of these would be familiar from any course that covers universal Turing machines or undecidable properties of computable functions. A certain amount of basic recursion theory is developed in the text using PCF, including a simple exercise showing that the halting problem for PCF programs is not programmable in PCF.

Programming. Although no specific programming experience is required, students with some exposure to a programming language with higher-order functions, such as Lisp, Scheme or ML, will find it easier to relate this theory to practice. To give a general feel for the expressiveness of typed lambda calculus, Chapter 2 contains a series of programming examples and techniques. This provides a self-contained overview of some relevant programming issues.

Category theory. Category theory appears only in more advanced sections of the book. While all the necessary definitions are presented and illustrated by example, a non-mathematical reader with no prior exposure to category theory may wish to consult additional sources. If a more leisurely or comprehensive introduction is needed, the reader is referred to an elementary introduction tailored to computer scientists, e.g., [BW90, Pie91].

Sample Course Outlines

Three sample course outlines are given in Tables 0.1 through 0.3. The first is an introductory course that has been taught several times as Stanford CS 258. The listed prerequisites for this course, which covers the core topics in Chapters 2–6, are a one-quarter course in automata and computability theory and a one-quarter course that includes mathematical logic but does not cover soundness, completeness or model-theoretic constructions in depth. CS 258 has been completed successfully by undergraduates, M.S. students specializing in systems or theory, and beginning Ph.D. students. While the Stanford course is taught in 10 weeks, it is easy to expand the course to a 15-week semester. Some options for expansion are: (i) cover the topics listed at a more leisurely pace, (ii) include the section on algebraic rewrite systems, (iii) prove soundness, completeness and other properties of typed lambda calculus, or (iv) survey selected topics from Chapters 9–11. It is also possible to drop imperative programs (Chapter 6) in favor of one or more of these options. While the chapter on algebra (Chapter 3) is not strictly required for later topics, universal algebra provides a useful opportunity to introduce or review logical concepts in a relatively simple mathematical setting. This aspect of the chapter may be redundant if students have taken a more rigorous undergraduate course on mathematical logic.

The second course, in Table 0.2, is a more mathematical course on typed lambda calculus and semantic techniques, with more technical detail and less programming motivation. The third course, in Table 0.3, covers type systems, beginning with typed lambda calculus and proceeding with polymorphism, subtyping and type inference. These three overlapping courses cover most of the book.

Acknowledgements and Disclaimers

Many people have read drafts and provided useful comments and suggestions. I would like to thank M. Abadi, S. Abramsky, V. Breazu-Tannen, K. Bruce, L. Cardelli, R. Casley, P.-L. Curien, P. Gardner, D. Gifford, D. Gries, C. Gunter, R. Harper, S. Hayashi, F. Henglein, B. Howard, P. Kanellakis, A. Kfoury, P. Lescanne, H. Mairson, I. Mason, A. Meyer, E. Moggi, N. Marti-Oliet, A.

Pitts, J. Riecke, K. Ross, D. Sanella, P. Scott, D. Tranah, T. Uribe and the students of Stanford CS 258 and CS 358. Special thanks to teaching assistants My Hoang, Brian Howard and Ramesh Viswanathan for their help with homework exercises and sample solutions, a few of which made their way into examples in the text.

Almost all of this book is based on previously published research, some by the author. When specific results are taken from the literature, an effort has been made to cite original sources as well as relevant survey articles and books. However, as with any project of this size, there are likely to be some errors and omissions. In addition, while an effort has been made to circulate and teach any original material or alternate proofs developed for this book, there are undoubtably some remaining errors.

John C. Mitchell Stanford, CA

Sample Introductory Course

- 1. Functional programming and typed lambda calculus (Chapter 2)
 - (a) Boolean, natural number, pairing and function expressions; definition of recursive functions using fixed-point operator (Section 2.2)
 - (b) Comparison of axiomatic, operational and denotational semantics (Section 2.3)
 - (c) Properties of reduction; deterministic symbolic interpreters (Section 2.4)
 - (d) Programming techniques, expressive power, limitations (Section 2.5)
- 2. Universal algebra and algebraic data types (Chapter 3)
 - (a) Algebraic terms, equations and algebras (Sections 3.1–3)
 - (b) Equational proof system, soundness and completeness (Section 3.4)
 - (c) Homomorphisms and initiality (Section 3.5)
 - (d) Aspects of algebraic theory of data types (Section 3.6)
- 3. Semantics of typed lambda calculus and recursion (Parts of Chapters 4 and 5)
 - (a) Presentation of context-sensitive syntax by typing rules (Sections 4.3.1, 4.3.2, 4.3.5)
 - (b) General models, summary of soundness and completeness (Sections 4.5.1–4)
 - (c) Domain-theoretic models of typed lambda calculus with fixed-point operators (Sections 5.1 and 5.2; Sections 5.3 and 5.4 time permitting)
- 4. Imperative programs (Chapter 6)
 - (a) Syntax of while programs; L-values and R-values (Section 6.2)
 - (b) Structured operational semantics (Section 6.3)
 - (c) Denotational semantics using typed lambda calculus with *location* and *store* types, fixed-point operator (Section 6.4)
 - (d) Partial correctness assertions. Soundness, relative completeness and example proofs (Section 6.5)

Table 0.1: Introductory course outline

Course on semantics and typed lambda calculus

- 1. Syntax and proof systems of typed lambda calculus
 - (a) Context-sensitive syntax and typing algorithm (Sections 4.1—3)
 - (b) Equational proof system and reduction (Section 4.4)
 - (c) Recursion using fixed-point operators (Skim 2.2.2–4, cover 2.2.5)
 - (d) Recursive types and explicit lifting (Section 2.6)
- 2. Model theory of typed lambda calculus
 - (a) General definitions, soundness and completeness (Sections 4.4.1, 4.5.1–6)
 - (b) Domains (Sections 5.1, 5.2)
 - (c) Modest sets (Sections 5.5, 5.6)
- 3. Logical relations
 - (a) Definition and basic lemmas (Sections 8.1, 8.2)
 - (b) Proof-theoretic results: completeness, normalization and confluence (Section 8.3)
 - (c) Completeness theorems for set-theoretic hierarchy, modest sets and domains (Section 8.4)
- 4. Category theory and recursive types
 - (a) Categories, functors and natural transformations (Sections 7.1, 7.2.1–2)
 - (b) Cartesian closed categories and typed lambda calculus (Section 7.2.3–6)
 - (c) An example of a category that is not well-pointed: Kripke lambda models (Section 7.3)
 - (d) Domain models of recursive types (Section 7.4)

Table 0.2: Mathematical course on typed lambda calculus

Course on type theory

- 1. Simply-typed lambda calculus
 - (a) Context-sensitive syntax and typing algorithm (Sections 4.1–3)
 - (b) Equational proof system and reduction (Section 4.4.1, 4.4.2)

2. Polymorphism

- (a) Introduction to polymorphic types (Section 9.1)
- (b) Predicative polymorphism (Section 9.2)
- (c) Properties of impredicative polymorphism (Section 9.3.1–4)
- (d) Data abstraction and existential types (Section 9.4)
- (e) General products, sums and program modules (Section 9.5)

3. Subtyping

- (a) Basic syntactic issues, equational reasoning, containment and conversion interpretations of subtyping (Sections 10.1–10.4)
- (b) Records, recursive types, records-as-objects (Section 10.5)
- (c) Polymorphism with subtype constraints (Section 10.6)

4. Type inference

- (a) Type inference and erasure functions (Section 11.1)
- (b) Type inference for simply-type lambda calculus using unification (Section 11.2)
- (c) ML-style polymorphic declarations (Section 11.3)

Table 0.3: Course on type theory